



MANITOU SPRINGS
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, November 4, 2009, 7:00 P.M.

I. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Manitou Springs Historic Preservation Commission was held Wednesday, November 4, 2009 in Council Chambers @ 606 Manitou Avenue. Chairwoman Nichols called the meeting to order at 7:02 pm and declared a quorum present. The following were in attendance:

PRESENT: Commissioner CHARLES CASE
Alternate Commissioner BARBARA DIAMOND
Commissioner RANDY HODGES
Chairwoman ANN NICHOLS
Vice Chair MOLLY WINGATE
Commissioner TAMMILA WRIGHT

ABSENT: Commissioner KAREN CULLEN (excused)

GUESTS: None

STAFF: Dan Folke, Planning Director
Michelle Anthony, City Planner
Kari Kilroy, Assistant

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

ITEM 1. Minutes from September 2, 2009 Regular Meeting.

Chairwoman Nichols referred to the last paragraph on page 7. She was quoted as having said that the HPC had a “circumvented” role. She could not remember what she said exactly but felt it was not circumvented – perhaps circumscribed?

(NOTE: Planning Assistant Kari Kilroy reviewed the recording of the September 2, 2009 meeting and confirmed that Chairwoman Nichols did, in fact, use the term “circumvented”.)

MOTION:

Vice Chair Wingate moved to accept the Minutes with the change indicated.

SECOND:

Commissioner Case seconded the motion.

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0.

III. NOTICE OF COUNCIL ACTION

MCAC 0906 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (Request to be Removed from the Historic District) – 328 Manitou Avenue (Green Willow Motel) – Beverly & Ronald Heruth, Applicants. Council discussed this item during a Worksession on September 22, 2009. During their Regular Meeting on October 6, 2009, Council upheld the HPC’s decision to deny the request.

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

ITEM 2. MCAC 0908 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (MCAC 0811 State Tax Credit – Final Approval) – 723 Manitou Avenue – Rhynette Bergmann, Applicant.

DISCUSSION REGARDING REQUEST AND PUBLIC COMMENT:

Michelle Anthony (City Planner) explained that the Applicant was still completing the breakdown of qualified and nonqualified costs for the State Tax Credit certification and asked that the item be postponed until the December 2, 2009 meeting.

MOTION:

Commissioner Case moved to postpone MCAC 0908 until the Commission’s Regular meeting on December 2, 2009.

SECOND:

Commissioner Hodges seconded the Motion

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0.

Chairwoman Nichols reviewed the meeting procedures and asked the Commissioners if they had any ex parte contacts or conflicts of interest to declare. Hearing none the meeting continued.

V. NEW BUSINESS

ITEM 3. MCAC 0907 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (New Residence) – 14 Edgewood Pathway – Bill & 2 Chucks, Applicant.

DISCUSSION REGARDING REQUEST AND PUBLIC COMMENT:

Michelle Anthony (City Planner) presented the Staff Report prepared October 30, 2009 recommending approval with 6 conditions. She mentioned that the Applicant had submitted modified plans that day, which changed the garage, building footprint, and the design materials.

Vice Chair Wingate asked Ms. Anthony to comment on the windows – she felt that there was a lot of glass and it was not broken up. Ms. Anthony explained that the design was not traditional Craftsman, rather a contemporary version with Craftsman elements. As such, Staff did not feel it was necessary to require divided lite windows. She went on to say that it was a contemporary home and would “read” as a contemporary home. Ms. Anthony also added that it was a product of the area – it was not surrounded by historic structures.

Chairwoman Wingate commented that she had had the same concern in that Craftsman style windows were usually 1/1 and she, too, wondered about the unbroken glass panes.

Commissioner Case confirmed with Ms. Anthony that the new Guidelines were used to evaluate the project. He asked about the checklist. Ms. Anthony explained that it was not yet finalized.

Commissioner Case asked Ms. Anthony to define “massing”. In simple terms, Ms. Anthony said it had to do with the relative size appearance of any one element. Commissioner Case asked if it was correct to say that if there was a long structure, one could break it up visually to reduce the massing. Ms. Anthony replied yes and added that it would put it on a more “human scale”. Commissioner Case stated that the HPC approved the recently-built townhouses in the same area because the massing was broken up visually.

Discussion ensued.

Dan Folke (Planning Director) read the definition of “mass” from the Design Guidelines: “The physical size and bulk of a structure.” He also summarized Guideline 5.4 regarding mass and scale for new residential construction.

Vice Chair Wingate remarked that the lot coverage on the original set of plans was 27%. Would it be less on the modified version? Ms. Anthony said she had not recalculated the coverage, but felt it should be less – perhaps 23%-25%.

Chairwoman Nichols asked if the subdivision had been through the Planning Commission [to combine 3 lots into 1]. Ms. Anthony said it would be heard by Planning next week – November 11. Chairwoman Nichols confirmed with Mr. Folke and Ms. Anthony that there were no HLDR issues.

Chuck Englund (Applicant), 119 Canon Avenue, detailed some features of the proposed house, mentioning that the massing was broken into 3 components and that the roof would be simulated shake shingles (fiber glass). He said that the house would be sprinkled and that the neighbors above were pleased with the design as it would preserve their view. Mr. Englund discussed the modification of the garage and explained that there was a shared driveway easement with the existing home on Edgewood.

Chairwoman Nichols summarized some of Mr. Englund's comments saying that the windows would be colored vinyl, that he had addressed the siding and that the rear would be stucco.

Ms. Anthony asked Mr. Englund about the columns. He explained that they would not be round, rather square 6" x 6" double columns.

Chairwoman Nichols opened the hearing to the public.

Kimberly A. Powell, 3 Fairmont Avenue, said she lived just down the street, to the northeast, and had lived through all the development in the area and supposedly the road was going to be paved [but it was not]. Her major concern was traffic, dust, dirt and noise. Ms. Powell said that there was a road on the map, but it was not built. It would go to her house and could provide a 2nd way out.

Chairwoman Nichols felt that Ms. Powell was raising valid issues that were not in the Historic Preservation Commission's purview and encouraged her to address them to the Planning Commission.

Ms. Powell went on to say that her house was 109 years old and not one house up there was 4,000 square feet. She felt it was a beautiful home they were proposing and she would build a 3-car garage if she could. She had no problems with that and felt it would be a lot nicer than any others built up there.

Chairwoman Nichols again encouraged Ms. Powell to attend the Planning Commission meeting on November 11, 2009.

Seeing and hearing no further comment, Chairwoman Nichols closed the hearing to the public.

Commissioner Case felt that the revised plan broke up the home so that it looked like 3 houses and rebalanced it. He liked the replacement of the large window in the spiral staircase. Commissioner Case also commented that large panes of glass were quite compatible with the Craftsman style. He thought it was a wonderful design and appreciated the design changes.

Vice Chair Wingate was grateful for the nice relationship between the topography and the design.

Commissioner Case added that it was in the Historic District, but a mitigating circumstance was that it was at the end of an eclectic subdistrict.

MOTION:

Vice Chair Wingate moved to approve MCAC 0907 for a new single family home at 14 Edgewood Pathway based on the plans submitted November 4, 2009 and with the following conditions:

- 1) Areas showing as stucco on the Front, Right, or Left elevations shall be changed to clapboard materials.
- 2) Trim around windows and doors will be wood or wood-like material (not stuccoed).
- 3) All retaining, landscaping, or entry walls visible to Edgewood Pathway shall be constructed of pavestone block.
- 4) This approval is valid for one year, or until the end of November 2010.

Vice Chair Wingate further recommended the finding that, under the conditions imposed, the proposed construction met the intent of the Design Guidelines and was suitable for construction at the specific location in the area of the Historic District in which it was proposed

SECOND:

Commissioner Case seconded the Motion.

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0.

Chairwoman Nichols asked the Commissioners if they had any ex parte contacts or conflicts of interest to declare. Hearing none the meeting continued.

ITEM 4. MCAC 0909 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (Studio) – 12 Oklahoma Road – Mark Wong, Applicant.

DISCUSSION REGARDING REQUEST AND PUBLIC COMMENT:

Michelle Anthony (City Planner) detailed the Staff Report prepared October 29, 2009 recommending approval of the proposed 20' x 20' studio with 6 conditions.

Commissioner Case asked if Staff had measured the roof slope. Ms. Anthony replied no.

Mark Wong (Applicant), 12 Oklahoma Road, discussed with Commissioner Case how he had measured the roof. He explained that he needed the studio for room to work. Mr. Wong said that windows on the north side would be great and he would be adding electricity.

Chairwoman Nichols confirmed with Mr. Wong that the studio would be foundation slab on grade and that Mr. Wong was okay with Staff's proposed conditions.

Vice Chair Wingate liked the 6/6 windows on the existing home and suggested the Applicant do the same on the studio. She asked Mr. Wong if he was okay with 2 windows and Mr. Wong replied yes.

Vice Chair Wingate asked Mr. Wong if he was going to have a kiln in the studio. Mr. Wong replied yes, a couple of electric kilns.

There was no public comment.

Vice Chair Wingate was concerned about the possibility of the studio becoming housing. Ms. Anthony explained that this was addressed in the Variance approval.

MOTION:

Commissioner Hodges moved to approve MCAC 0909 for the construction of a 20' x 20' studio at 12 Oklahoma Road with the following conditions:

- 1) The central ridge roof form alternative with a 5" overhang and boxed-in rafters shall be used for the new construction.
- 2) Siding shall be installed on the new structure, at a reveal to match the existing horizontal siding on the existing house.
- 3) The street-facing gable of the studio shall feature horizontal board and batten siding to match the existing house.
- 4) The Applicant shall add to the north wall of the new studio two 6/6 divided lite windows and trim similar in size, operation, and design to the existing window located to the west of the front porch on the existing house. Staff is authorized to review and approve an alternate design that includes additional Architectural features on this façade.
- 5) Any significant area of exposed concrete foundation (over 6") shall be clad with lattice screening or manufactured stone compatible with the treatment on the front porch.
- 6) This approval is valid for one year, or until the end of November 2010.

Commissioner Hodges further recommended that, under the conditions imposed, the proposed construction met the intent of the Design Guidelines.

SECOND:

Vice Chair Wingate seconded the Motion.

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

ITEM 5. Presentation by Manitou Springs Historic Society.

Peggy Yager and other representatives of the Manitou Springs Historic Society presented several plat maps and survey books to the Commission.

ITEM 6. Update on Historic Bridges and Walls Assessment Project.

Ms. Anthony reported that there were no updates as the project was essentially done.

ITEM 7. Other.

Vice Chair Wingate made a request for a Code Enforcement Officer. Mr. Folke explained the progress on that issue.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

As there was no further business before the Commission, Chairwoman Nichols adjourned the meeting at 9:02 pm.

Minutes submitted by Kari Kilroy