



**MANITOU SPRINGS
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday, March 3, 2010, 7:00 P.M.**

I. CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Manitou Springs Historic Preservation Commission was held Wednesday, March 3, 2010 in Council Chambers @ 606 Manitou Avenue. Chairwoman Nichols called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm and declared a quorum present. The following were in attendance:

PRESENT: Commissioner CHARLES CASE
Alternate Commissioner BARBARA DIAMOND
Commissioner RANDY HODGES
Commissioner ANNE HYDE
Chairwoman ANN NICHOLS
Vice Chair MOLLY WINGATE
Commissioner TAMMILA WRIGHT

ABSENT: Commissioner KAREN CULLEN (excused)

GUESTS: Councilman Rick Barry

STAFF: Dan Folke, Planning Director
Michelle Anthony, City Planner
Kari Kilroy, Assistant

ITEM 1. Nomination and Election of Chair

Chairwoman Nichols explained that the tradition had been for the Vice Chair to move into the Chair position.

MOTION:

Commissioner Case moved to nominate Vice Chair Wingate as Chair.

SECOND:

Commissioner Wright seconded the Motion.

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0 (Commissioner Wingate abstained).

ITEM 2. Nomination and Election of Vice Chair

MOTION:

Commissioner Hyde moved to nominate Commissioner Hodges as Vice Chair.

SECOND:

Commissioner Case seconded the Motion.

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0 (Commissioner Hodges abstained).

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

ITEM 3. Minutes from January 6, 2009 Regular Meeting.

MOTION:

Commissioner Nichols moved to accept the Minutes as presented.

SECOND:

Vice Chair Hodges seconded the motion.

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 6-0 (Commissioner Diamond abstained).

III. NOTICE OF COUNCIL ACTION

AP 0903 – Appeal of Historic Preservation Commission Denial of MCAC 0911 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (Temporary Accessory Structure), 201 Spencer Avenue, Clint Lewis, Applicant. During their January 19, 2010 Regular Meeting, Council voted unanimously to uphold HPC’s decision.

MCAC 0910 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (Demolition) – 1134 Manitou Avenue – Chad Kuzbek (WestWorks Engineering) on behalf of the Manitou Springs Metropolitan Parking District, Applicant. During their February 2, 2010 Regular Meeting, Council voted unanimously to approve the request.

Chairwoman Wingate reviewed the meeting procedures and asked the Commissioners if they had any ex parte contacts or conflicts of interest to declare. There were none.

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

V. NEW BUSINESS

ITEM 4. MCAC 1001 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (New Residence) – 11 Oklahoma Road – Steven Smith (Sunset Ridge Dream Homes LLC) on behalf of Viki and Tim Figge, Applicant.

DISCUSSION REGARDING REQUEST AND PUBLIC COMMENT:

Michelle Anthony (City Planner) presented the Staff Report dated 02/24/10. Staff recommended approval with six conditions.

Commissioner Case asked Ms. Anthony to summarize the differences between this request and the request previously approved by the HPC. Ms. Anthony was not sure that every detail matched but characterized them as being very close.

Steve Smith (Applicant), 12085 Silver Medal Drive in Black Forest, said that the property owners were favorable to making concessions. He next detailed their response to each of Staff's proposed conditions:

- 1) *Windows and doors shall not have divided light grilles or grids. – OK*
- 2) *The Applicant will work with Staff for approval of a manufactured stone profile that is compatible in pattern, texture and color with historic stonework in the surrounding area. – Mr. Smith said that the owners were out of town. He showed the Commission a sample of what he proposed and said he would discuss it with the owners when they returned.*
- 3) *The garage elevation shall be modified as follows:*
 - *Cantilever the second floor of this elevation out up to the allowed 10' setback line, thereby recessing the garage and reducing its visual impact. . – Too expensive, especially because there was only attic space above the garage*
 - *Utilize two, separate garage doors. – OK – the designer would begin working on it and submit it to Staff.*
 - *Add a pedestrian entrance to the right of the garage door(s), with a small covered entry to provide more Architectural interest and an element of more appropriate scale to this elevation. – OK*
- 4) *The Applicant shall provide information on the proposed design, location and specifications for any exterior lighting to be incorporated on the home for Staff approval prior to purchase or installation. – Mr. Smith explained that they would do lighting with a carriage house design/wrought iron look on either side of the garage doors but they had not yet selected it; they would bring the selection to Staff. There would also be can lighting on the porch at the rear of the house and four cans on the front covered porch.*

- 5) *Any exposed concrete visible from either Oklahoma Road or Elk Path Avenue shall be integrally colored using the City's adopted mix, or as approved by Staff to integrate with the property conditions.* – No problem; there would be brown decking, brown stone, pale yellow body, white trim and brown architectural roof.

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Hyde wondered if the Applicant needed to begin construction within the year, or finish it. Ms. Anthony explained that the Applicant needed to pull a building permit by the end of March 2011.

Commissioner Case confirmed with Ms. Anthony that the existing retaining wall was to remain.

MOTION:

Commissioner Diamond moved to approve MCAC 1001 for a new single family home at 11 Oklahoma Road based on the plans and information submitted February 9, 2010 and with the following conditions:

- 1) Windows and doors shall not have divided light grilles or grids.
- 2) The Applicant will work with Staff for approval of a manufactured stone profile that is compatible in pattern, texture and color with historic stonework in the surrounding area.
- 3) The garage elevation shall be modified as follows:
 - Utilize two, separate garage doors.
 - Add a pedestrian entrance to the right of the garage door(s), with a small covered entry to provide more Architectural interest and an element of more appropriate scale to this elevation.
- 4) The Applicant shall provide information on the proposed design, location and specifications for any exterior lighting to be incorporated on the home for Staff approval prior to purchase or installation.
- 5) Any exposed concrete visible from either Oklahoma Road or Elk Path Avenue shall be integrally colored using the City's adopted mix, or as approved by Staff to integrate with the property conditions.
- 6) This approval is valid for one year, or until the end of March 2011.

Commissioner Diamond further recommended the finding that, under the conditions, the proposed construction met the intent of the Design Guidelines and was suitable for construction at the specific location in the area of the Historic District in which it was proposed.

SECOND:

Commissioner Wright seconded the Motion

DISCUSSION:

None.

VOTE:

Motion passed, 7-0.

ITEM 5. MCAC 1002 – Material Change of Appearance Certification (Demolition and New Residence – Preliminary Meeting) – 108 Elk Path – John McGee on behalf of Star Lumber & Supply Co., Inc., Applicant.

DISCUSSION REGARDING REQUEST AND PUBLIC COMMENT:

Michelle Anthony (City Planner) presented the Staff Memo dated 02/25/10.

Commissioner Nichols wondered why Staff required a survey of the property if the property was noncontributing. Ms. Anthony replied that although alterations to the property had been done, it was not apparent just from the exterior that it was obviously noncontributing.

Ms. Anthony, Dan Folke (Planning Director) and Commissioner Nichols discussed the difference between this submittal and a previous demolition request at 25 Fountain Place.

Commissioner Hyde was concerned about the character of the neighborhood disappearing and wanted a better sense of what kind of mix was there. She wondered how many of the cabin-type structures had been demolished in the past few years. Ms. Anthony was not aware of any and replied that the closest was at 25 Fountain Place.

Chairwoman Wingate knew it was not in HPC's purview, but wondered if there were concerns about water pressure. Dan Folke (Planning Director) said that that decision would be made when permits were pulled and explained that the MSFD did fire flow tests.

John McGee (Applicant), 324 Clarksley Road, responding to Staff's Memo, said that they had not averaged potential tax credits into the cost of the house because it was his understanding that tax credits were not automatic. He explained the history of the property ownership and felt that the proposed home would fit in the neighborhood. Mr. McGee felt that the Commission would get a better sense of the additions made to the existing home when they went inside. Also responding to Staff's Memo, Mr. McGee preferred for Staff to fill out the survey paperwork. He finished by asking Ms. Anthony how the determination was made if it was a contributing structure. Ms. Anthony replied it was made mainly by observing the exterior.

Per Chairwoman Wingate's question, Mr. McGee discussed the work needed to rehabilitate the house.

Commissioner Case wondered about discussing the replacement structure. Mr. Folke said that it was appropriate for the Commission to provide feedback to the Applicant.

Mr. Folke asked Mr. McGee if their estimates included a new foundation. Mr. McGee discussed the details and said they had figured the costs as new knowing that there would be a cost for tear out.

Chairwoman Wingate asked if they had considered rehabilitation of the house and then an addition. Mr. McGee replied no.

Commissioner Case asked Mr. McGee what the proposed square footage was. He replied 1,700.

Mr. McGee, responding to concerns about the garage in the Staff Memo, explained that the owners liked the existing trees and were concerned about losing them if they moved the garage. He discussed some alternatives. Chairwoman Wingate suggested that Staff could address the garage issue.

Chairwoman Wingate commented that the garage doors, dormer peak over the front door and a “boat load” of roof jumped out at her. She was not sure about those aspects of the proposal. Mr. McGee said that it was good information that the owners would be willing to address.

Commissioner Case discussed the roof peaks and how two new homes would be an impact to the neighborhood. He suggested 1/1 windows would be better than divided lite windows.

There was no public comment.

Chairwoman Wingate commented that it was a gorgeous lot.

Ms. Anthony suggested the Commission schedule a site visit and confirmed that the information in regard to the contributing status and the contractors estimate advice as outlined in the Staff memo would be provided at the next meeting. The consensus was to hold the site visit on Sunday, March 14 at 1:00 pm and to set a public hearing date during the April HPC meeting.

VI. OTHER BUSINESS

ITEM 6. Other.

Mr. Folke updated the Commission as to the hiring of a new Code Enforcement Officer – Marta Dubay would begin on March 22, 2010.

Chairwoman Wingate mentioned that the Commission was in need of two Alternate Commissioners.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

As there was no further business before the Commission, Chairwoman Wingate adjourned the meeting at 8:17 pm.

Minutes submitted by Kari Kilroy