

# BROOK STREET BRIDGE

HISTORY AND CONSIDERATIONS FOR CONSTRUCTION and  
RESULTS FROM TOWNHALL MEETING CONDUCTED ON 6/14/17

JUNE 2017

# TOWNHALL MEETING RESULTS

- ▶ ATTENDEES EXPRESSED DISDAIN ABOUT THE CONTENT OF THIS PRESENTATION AND PROCESS TO DATE—and QUESTIONED THE ACCURACY OF THE INFORMATION PRESENTED BY STAFF. ITEMS THAT WERE PARTICULARLY QUESTIONED INCLUDED DESIGN LIFE OF A REHABILITATED BRIDGE, VARIABLES PRESENTED FOR CONSIDERATION
- ▶ THE PRESENTATION HAS BEEN MODIFIED TO INCORPORATE THOSE COMMENTS inasmuch as possible:
  - ▶ A SIMPLIFIED VOTE FOR **REHABILITATION** OR FOR **DECONSTRUCTION/RECONSTRUCTION**
  - ▶ REMOVAL OF NON-WEIGHTED COMPARISON
  - ▶ ADD CONSIDERATION FOR IMPACT ON RESIDENTS
  - ▶ CONSIDERATION REGARDING “LOCAL” VERSUS “NON-LOCAL” CONTRACTOR

- ▶ **THOSE IN ATTENDANCE (55) AT THE 6/14/17 TOWNHALL MEETING VOTED UNANIMOUSLY IN FAVOR OF THE REHABILITATION OF THE BROOK STREET BRIDGE**

# 2015 STORM EVENT CAUSES DAMAGES AND RESULTS IN BRIDGE CLOSURE

- ▶ IN THE SPRING OF 2015 THE BRIDGE WAS CLOSED DUE TO SIGNIFICANT DAMAGE TO THE ARCH
- ▶ THE BRIDGE REMAINS CLOSED TO BOTH VEHICULAR AND PEDESTRIAN USE



# TERMINOLOGY:

## REHABILITATION

Rehabilitation would mean that the existing bridge is brought to current standards (repaired to comply with all applicable present-day code provisions and engineering best principles and practices), with minimal impacts to the existing structure and appearance of the Brook Street Bridge.

## DECONSTRUCTION FOLLOWED BY RECONSTRUCTION

Deconstruction followed by Reconstruction would include the removal of the existing Brook Street Bridge and that the removed material would be salvaged inasmuch as possible and incorporated into a new bridge built to current standards (repaired to comply with all applicable present-day code provisions and engineering best principles and practices)

# CONCURRENT PROCESSES

- ▶ NUMEROUS ALTERNATIVES HAVE BEEN CONSIDERED, WITH COUNCIL ULTIMATELY DIRECTING THAT STAFF LOOK SPECIFICALLY AT TWO PROCESSES CONCURRENTLY:
  - ▶ 1. REHABILITATION
  - ▶ 2. DECONSTRUCTION/RECONSTRUCTION
  - ▶ City Council will consider one of these two options ON June 27, 2017
- ▶ MAYOR NICOLETTA REQUESTED STAFF CONDUCT A TOWNHALL MEETING SO THE PUBLIC COULD VOICE AN OPINION ON THESE ALTERNATIVES, AND HELP COUNCIL WITH THE DECISION MAKING PROCESS
- ▶ Staff has combined deconstruction and reconstruction costs, as Council has indicated that the bridge would not be deconstructed without reconstruction.



# PLAN MANITOU CONSIDERATIONS

- ▶ **Historic & Cultural**
- ▶ **GOAL HC-4 Maintain and enhance existing cultural and historic resources as part of transportation & infrastructure improvements**
  - ▶ Policy HC-4.1 Infrastructure - Preserve historic bridges . . . during construction, renovation, or maintenance. . . to the maximum extent practicable
  - ▶ **City has closely evaluated two approaches to evaluate what is practicable**
  - ▶ Policy HC-4.3 Risk Reduction. Prioritize public safety over historic preservation when risk posed by a historic structure is high. Explore options for repair and restoration . . . before making determination to demolish.
  - ▶ **City initially determined public safety risk was high but proceeded to explore options for repair and restoration in depth before making determination - policy is met.**
  - ▶ Policy HC-4.4 Community Involvement. Seek community input on infra and mitigation projects in historic district.
  - ▶ Evaluate potential tradeoffs, potential impacts on character of historic district, as well as mitigation benefits.
  - ▶ **This and other public meetings have been held to gather community feedback on each method and public input has been considered at Council meetings. Policy HC-4.6 HPC - policy supports HPC involvement to provide a recommendation early in process on how to best protect and preserve resources.**
- ▶ **Infrastructure and Public Services**
- ▶ **Policy IP-2.4 Operations and Maintenance.** This policy directs decision makers to consider the fiscal impacts of operations and maintenance costs of new or expanded infrastructure, services, and amenities before making decisions.
  - ▶ **This Brook Street Bridge presentation incorporates criteria to compare the long-term maintenance costs and overall project costs for each method.**

EXTRAPOLATED ANNUAL COSTS BASED ON DESIGN LIFE AND ESTIMATES PROVIDED BY CONTRACTORS—it should be noted that reconstruction costs could vary based on construction cost at the time reconstruction occurs:

▶ REHABILITATION

- ▶ ANNUAL COST OVER TWENTY FIVE YEAR PERIOD: \$11,741.92
- ▶ ANNUAL COST OVER FIFTY YEAR PERIOD: \$23,483.84

DECONSTRUCTION/RECONSTRUCTION

- ▶ ANNUAL COST OVER TWENTY FIVE YEAR PERIOD: \$22,913
- ▶ ANNUAL COST OVER FIFTY YEAR PERIOD: \$11,457.04

Please Note: The Following Table is a simple method to help guide your evaluation of the two options. The idea is to have an idea of the criteria that Council members may use when making their decision. Council has to weigh many factors when making decisions that impact the entire community. Please use this table as much or as little when contemplating your preference for the future of the Brook Street Bridge.



<i>Variables to Consider</i>	Rehabilitation:	Deconstruction/ Reconstruction		
Design Life: Data has been supplied by a Professional Engineer. Participants at the Town Hall took issue with some of these numbers, questioning the criteria used to reach them. We present them here as they were provided to the City via an objective party.	25 Years	75-100 years		
Historic Implications	None	Bridge Removed, Material Saved, Salvaged and Incorporated in Reconstruction		
Fire Access	Unchanged	Unchanged		
Impact to Ruxton Traffic flow During Construction	16-20 Weeks	15 Weeks		
IMPACTS TO LOCAL RESIDENTS	Once complete, none	Once complete, none		
LOCAL VERSUS NON LOCAL CONTRACTOR	Contract with <b>Local</b> Company will be voted on June 27th	Contract with <b>International</b> Firm will be voted on June 27th		
Total Cost Estimate	\$293,458.00 plus inspections	\$600,000.00 plus inspections		

Please Follow the Link Below to Vote

▶ <https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/6L5HGCM>